Supplementary Information

CO₂ forcing alone insufficient to explain Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum warming

Richard E. Zeebe, James C. Zachos, and Gerald R. Dickens

Submitted to *Nature Geoscience*.
June 5, 2009
1 Model description

For our simulations of the PETM, we used the Long-term Ocean-atmosphere-Sediment CArbon cycle Reservoir Model (LOSCAR, see refs. 1–3), a carbon-cycle box model (modified after ref. 4), coupled to a sediment module\(^5\). The model includes biogeochemical cycles of total carbon, total alkalinity, phosphate, oxygen, and stable carbon isotopes. Weathering of carbonate and silicate mineral rocks is parameterized in the model as a function of atmospheric CO\(_2\) (refs. 3,4). The model uses realistic volumes of ocean basins based on a Paleocene/Eocene topography\(^6\). The Atlantic, Indian, Pacific, and Tethys Ocean basins are each subdivided into surface, intermediate, and deep boxes. Prior to the PETM, deepwater formation in the model was prescribed to occur in the Southern Ocean, consistent with observations\(^7\). The sediment model calculates $\%$CaCO\(_3\) (dry weight) in the bioturbated (mixed) interval of sediment as a function of rain, dissolution, burial, and chemical erosion. The thickness of this sediment layer ($h_s$) is typically 8 cm (see Table S1); the sediment model is more fully described elsewhere\(^5\).

Ocean carbonate chemistry routines to calculate parameters such as [CO\(_2\)], [CO\(_3\)\(^-\)], $p$H, and calcite saturation state from total CO\(_2\) and total alkalinity use algorithms as described in ref. 8. These allow for variations in the Ca\(^{2+}\) and Mg\(^{2+}\) concentration of seawater, which most likely differed from modern values during the Paleocene/Eocene\(^9\). In our PETM simulations, we used [Ca\(^{2+}\)] = 20 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) and [Mg\(^{2+}\)] = 30 mmol kg\(^{-1}\), rather than the modern values of [Ca\(^{2+}\)] = 10 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) and [Mg\(^{2+}\)] = 53 mmol kg\(^{-1}\) (ref. 9). Warmer surface and bottom water temperatures in the late Paleocene and Eocene also impact equilibrium and solubility constants. For example, the calcite saturation concentration at a bottom water temperature of 14 – 17°C during the PETM is quite different from the modern one at 2°C (see Fig. 3 of ref. 5). In the model, we used bottom water temperatures of 12°C and 16°C prior to and during the PETM, respectively (Table S1), and included the effects of changes in temperature, and [Ca\(^{2+}\)] and [Mg\(^{2+}\)] on the stoichiometric constants.
One important consequence of changes in oceanic $[\text{Ca}^{2+}]$ is its effect on the ocean carbon inventory. The long-term carbon inventory and carbonate chemistry of the ocean-atmosphere system is controlled by atmospheric CO$_2$ and the balance between riverine flux and carbonate burial. Carbonate burial is tied to the deep-sea carbonate saturation, which is proportional to the product of $[\text{Ca}^{2+}] \times [\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$. If oceanic $[\text{Ca}^{2+}]$ doubles at constant saturation state, $[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ would be reduced by 50%. Thus, $[\text{CO}_3^{2-}]$ prior to the PETM was much lower than today if Eocene $[\text{Ca}^{2+}]$ was 20 mmol kg$^{-1}$. In the model, this leads to a pre-PETM ocean carbon inventory that is similar to today’s value (Table S1), despite a higher baseline atmospheric CO$_2$ at the time.

Carbonate ‘rain’ to the seafloor within the model is split into two broad locations: shelf/upper slope ($< 600$ m) and lower slope/rise/plains ($> 600$ m). The pre-PETM ratio of shallow-to-deep carbonate rain was increased relative to the modern because sea-level was higher, which promotes shallow water marine carbonate deposition [as has been documented for the Paleocene and Early Eocene]. In general, observations imply relatively less pelagic carbonate production during the early Cenozoic, which leads to a shallower CCD compared to the modern in agreement with observations (see below and ref. 9).

Several model parameters for the pre-PETM ocean and global carbon cycle are summarized in Table S1. Changes applied to the model during the PETM phase are described in the main paper.
Table S1. LOSCAR model parameter: Pre-PETM values.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Unit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$V_{oc}$</td>
<td>Volume ocean</td>
<td>1.29 $\times 10^{18}$</td>
<td>m$^3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$A_{oc}$</td>
<td>Area ocean</td>
<td>3.49 $\times 10^{14}$</td>
<td>m$^2$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$f_{Ai}$</td>
<td>%Area [A I P T H] $^a$</td>
<td>[15 14 52 9 10]</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$h_{L}$</td>
<td>Thickn. Low.-lat. surf.</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$h_{H}$</td>
<td>Thickn. High.-lat. surf.</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$h_{I}$</td>
<td>Thickn. interm. boxes</td>
<td>900</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$T$</td>
<td>Temperature [L I D H] $^b$</td>
<td>[25 16 12 12]</td>
<td>°C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THC</td>
<td>Conveyor circulation</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>c Sv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$M_{oc}^C$</td>
<td>Ocean C inventory</td>
<td>34,000</td>
<td>Pg C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$M_{sed}^C$</td>
<td>Sediment C inventory</td>
<td>620</td>
<td>Pg C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$F_{in}$</td>
<td>CaCO$_3$ riverine flux</td>
<td>16$x\times 10^{12}$</td>
<td>mol C y$^{-1}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$h_s$</td>
<td>Thickn. sediment mixed layer</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>m</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\rho_s$</td>
<td>Density, sediment solids</td>
<td>2.50 $\times 10^{3}$</td>
<td>kg m$^{-3}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$n_{Si}$</td>
<td>Silc. weathering param. $^d$</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$n_C$</td>
<td>Carb. weathering param. $^d$</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>–</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$Atlantic, Pacific, Indic, Tethys, and High-Latitude %Area (ref. 6).

$^b$Low-Lat., Intermediate, Deep, and High-Lat. temperature.

$^c$1 Sv = $10^6$ m$^3$ s$^{-1}$.

$^d$See ref. 3.
### 2 Mass and isotopic composition of carbon input

As pointed out in the main paper, the stable carbon isotope ($\delta^{13}C$) records alone are insufficient to determine mass and $\delta^{13}C$-value of the carbon input. The mass balance for total carbon and stable isotopes in the combined ocean-atmosphere-biosphere system after the input reads:

\[
M_f = M_i + M_s \tag{1}
\]
\[
R_f \times M_f = R_i \times M_i + R_s \times M_s \tag{2}
\]

where $M_j$’s are masses of carbon (in Pg C) and $R_j$’s are $^{13}C/^{12}C$ ratios of the final ($f$) and initial ($i$) inventory, and of the carbon source ($s$). Given an initial inventory plus initial and final $\delta^{13}C$-value, we are left with two equations [(1)–(2)] and three unknowns ($M_f, M_s, R_s$). In other words, either the input mass or its isotopic composition are still needed to solve the system. We have used deep-sea carbonate dissolution records to determine the input mass; its $\delta^{13}C$-value is then set by eqn. (2).

### 3 Model sensitivity to carbon release time

Our results presented in the main paper suggest a maximum initial carbon input of $\sim 3000$ Pg C. We have tested whether this estimate is sensitive to the time scale of carbon input (Fig. S1). In other words, if the carbon was released over a different period of time, would this allow for a different amount of carbon input? Because we are only interested here in the relative response to the duration of the initial input pulse, the continuous release and changes in ocean circulation (see main paper) have been omitted. In the following, we will discuss scenarios in which the release time was varied, while the total input (3000 Pg C) and its isotopic composition ($\delta^{13}C = -50\%$) were held constant. Other scenarios could include a larger input of isotopically heavier carbon over a longer time interval. However, this would lead to a slow and gradual CCD shoaling, which is at odds with observations.

A release time of $\sim 1,000$ y would have produced an initial, short-lived $\delta^{13}C$-
**Figure S1.** Model response to the release time of carbon input. Total carbon input is 3000 Pg C at $\delta^{13}C = -50\%_o$, deep Atlantic injection is 40%. The continuous carbon release and changes in ocean circulation (see manuscript) have been omitted here for clarity.

Drop of almost $6\%_o$ in surface ocean TCO$_2$. We are not aware of carbonate $\delta^{13}C$-data supporting this scenario as sites with little or no carbonate dissolution did not record such a $\delta^{13}C$-drop. Input times of $\sim 1,000$ y therefore appear unlikely, unless all carbonates that could have recorded such extreme values are absent from the records as a result of dissolution.

Increasing the release time ($t_R$) from 6 to 40 ky results in a moderate decrease of the maximum CIE by about $0.5\%_o$ (Fig. S1a). However, at $t_R = 40$ ky, the CCD shoaling is too weak compared to observations. For example, the reconstructed CCD shoaling in the Atlantic is $>2$ km (ref. 12), while the model predicts less than 600 m for release times longer than 40 ky (Fig. S1b). In summary, stretching the duration
of the carbon input would allow for a slightly higher carbon input at the same CIE. However, the implications for changes in the CCD appear inconsistent with the data.

4 The CCD before and during the PETM

Based on available %CaCO₃ records across the Upper Paleocene and Lower Eocene sediment sections from around the globe (Table S2), we have estimated the initial position and changes in the calcite compensation depth (CCD) before and during the PETM in the different ocean basins (Fig. S2).

Table S2. Sites included in CCD reconstruction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Basin</th>
<th>Leg</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Site</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Atlantic</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>Walvis Ridge</td>
<td>1262 1263 1265 1266 1267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southern Ocean</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>Maud Rise</td>
<td>690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Perth Abyss. Plain</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>Broken Ridge</td>
<td>752</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>Shatsky Rise</td>
<td>1208 1209 1210 1211 1212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>Central EqPac</td>
<td>1215 1220 1221</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sites at Walvis Ridge in the south-central Atlantic have been discussed in detail before⁵,¹² and indicate a dramatic CCD shoaling during the event by more than 2 km: from below 3.6 km prior to the event (Site 1262) to less than 1.5 km (Site 1263) during the PETM main phase (Fig. S2, blue bars). The pre-event carbonate content of ~80% at Site 1262 indicates a CCD deeper than 3.6 km in the south-central Atlantic prior to the event. This is consistent with the lower limit of earlier CCD reconstructions for the South Atlantic, based on the absence/presence of CaCO₃ in a variety of deep-sea cores¹³. In general, the Atlantic records suggest a pre-event CCD shallower than ~4 km (Fig. S5, refs. 13,14).

Southern Ocean Site 690 (paleowater depth ~ 2100 m) has also extensively been discussed in the literature. %CaCO₃ drops from initial 80% to around 60% (refs. 15,16). No clay layers comparable to those at Walvis Ridge are present. Site 690 was
Figure S2. Position of the CCD before and during the PETM main event, based on available sediment records. The Southern Ocean CCD reconstruction is based on Site 690, which was located above the CCD before, during, and after the event. This only constrains the upper limit (below ~2 km) but not the lower limit (red bars).

Located above the CCD before, during, and after the event. This indicates that the CCD in the Southern Ocean was below ~2 km prior to the event, while the %CaCO₃ drop at Site 690 indicates a slight CCD shoaling during the event (Fig. S2, red bars). Note that the CCD shoaling in the Southern Ocean must have been much less pronounced than in the Atlantic. At similar initial %CaCO₃ (80 – 90%) but shallower paleowater depth (~1.5 km), %CaCO₃ at Atlantic Site 1263 drops to zero during the PETM, while %CaCO₃ at the deeper Site 690 (~2 km) only drops to ~60%.

Carbonate records across the PETM in the Indian Ocean are sparse. We focus here on Sites 259 (Perth Abyssal Plain) and 752 (Broken Ridge)¹⁷,¹⁸. The paleowater depth of Site 259 during the PETM was probably > 4000 m (see Fig. 9 in ref. 17). Fig. S3a shows measured %CaCO₃ at Site 259 across the PETM¹⁷. The sampling interval across the P/E boundary was ~ 10 cm and could have missed an interval of minimum %CaCO₃. Nevertheless, the three samples taken across the boundary (corresponding to the carbon isotope excursion, CIE) have values of 40 – 80% CaCO₃. This is surprisingly high, given a paleowater depth of about 4 km. Site 259 could be a specific location and may not be representative for the average Indian Ocean before
Figure S2. Position of the CCD before and during the PETM main event, based on available sediment records. The Southern Ocean CCD reconstruction is based on Site 690, which was located above the CCD before, during, and after the event. This only constrains the upper limit (below ~2 km) but not the lower limit (red bars). Located above the CCD before, during, and after the event. This indicates that the CCD in the Southern Ocean was below ~2 km prior to the event, while the %CaCO₃ drop at Site 690 indicates a slight CCD shoaling during the event (Fig. S2, red bars).

Note that the CCD shoaling in the Southern Ocean must have been much less pronounced than in the Atlantic. At similar initial %CaCO₃ (80−90%) but shallower paleowater depth (~1.5 km), %CaCO₃ at Atlantic Site 1263 drops to zero during the PETM, while %CaCO₃ at the deeper Site 690 (~2 km) only drops to ~60%.

Carbonate records across the PETM in the Indian Ocean are sparse. We focus here on Sites 259 (Perth Abyssal Plain) and 752 (Broken Ridge) 17,18. The paleowater depth of Site 259 during the PETM was probably >4000 m (see Fig. 9 in ref. 17). Fig. S3a shows measured %CaCO₃ at Site 259 across the PETM 17. The sampling interval across the P/E boundary was ~10 cm and could have missed an interval of minimum %CaCO₃. Nevertheless, the three samples taken across the boundary (corresponding to the carbon isotope excursion, CIE) have values of 40−80% CaCO₃. This is surprisingly high, given a paleowater depth of about 4 km. Site 259 could be a specific location and may not be representative for the average Indian Ocean before and during the PETM. Nevertheless, the apparent absence of an extensive dissolution layer at this paleowater depth indicates a very minor CCD shoaling.

Indian Ocean Site 752 is located on Broken Ridge. Fig. 9 in ref. 18 indicates a lower bathyal/abyssal paleowater depth during the PETM but the paleowater depth of Site 752 during the PETM seems not well constrained (about 1−2 km). Nevertheless, the available %CaCO₃ data indicate that the main event-CCD did not shoal above this depth. In summary, if the minimum %CaCO₃ intervals at sites 259 and 752 have not been missed by the data sampling, then the CCD shoaling in the Indian Ocean (Fig. S2, gray bars) was much less severe (as seems to be the case in the Pacific and Southern Ocean) than in the Atlantic.

Information on the position of the Pacific CCD before and during the PETM is available from Leg 198 (Shatsky Rise, Sites 1208-1212) and Leg 199 (Sites 1215, 1220, 1221). Modern and paleowater depth of Site 1208 is/was ~3.3 km. Based
on available data, 1208 was located above (very close to) the CCD before, during, and after the event\textsuperscript{20}. Although there are no foraminifera in PETM sediments, the most robust nannofossils are preserved, showing that Site 1208 was not below the CCD during the PETM\textsuperscript{20}. This indicates that the CCD at this site was close to $\sim 3.5$ km before the event and only slightly shallower during the event. None of the Sites 1209-1212 shows any dramatic drop in $\%\text{CaCO}_3$ during the main event, i.e. throughout the duration of the CIE\textsuperscript{20}. At the shallower Sites 1209 and 1210 (paleowater depth 2400 and 2600 m), $\%\text{CaCO}_3$ drops from $>90\%$ to about $85\%$. At the deeper Sites 1212 and 1211 (paleowater depth 2600/2900 m), $\%\text{CaCO}_3$ drops from $>90\%$ to 70-80\%. This indicates that during the main event, the CCD at Shatsky rise did not shoal above 2.9 km and was probably located close to 3.3 km (Site 1208).

Colosimo et al.\textsuperscript{20} note an extremely thin (1 mm) dark brown clay seam within the PETM section in several locations at Shatsky Rise. This could indicate a CCD shoaling above the Shatsky Rise depth range for a very short interval at the onset of the event (for example, 1-2 k.y.), but leaving no substantial clay layer due to bioturbation. Alternatively, the clay seam may indicate the absence of carbonate rain during that interval. Irrespective of the reason, Figs. F5-F8 in ref. 20 show that a 1 mm layer would represent a very small portion (0.5 – 1\%) of the section covering the total CIE, which extends over 10 to 20 cm at sites 1209-1212. Furthermore, the inferred minor CCD shoaling at Shatsky Rise throughout the main event is consistent with the data obtained during Pacific Leg 199 (see below).

Site 1220 (Leg 199) is located in the Central Equatorial Pacific, the paleowater depth during PETM was $\sim 2900$ m. Calcium wt\% has been measured\textsuperscript{21} from which $\%\text{CaCO}_3$ has been calculated (see Geochemistry, p. 20, in Explanatory Notes chapter of Leg 199 in ref. 21). Throughout the PETM, $\%\text{CaCO}_3$ in 1220 remains at about 20\% (Fig. S4a). Neither $\%\text{Ca}$ nor $\%\text{CaCO}_3$ drop to zero anywhere within the PETM section. This suggests that Site 1220 at $\sim 2900$ m paleowater depth in the tropical Pacific was located above the CCD before and during the main PETM interval.

Note that Site 1220 shows several intervals of laminations (see Fig. F4, Site 1220
in ref. 21). Bioturbation, which has been suggested to explain the lack of clay layers at the Shatsky Rise sites20, can therefore be ruled out at Site 1220. Thus, bioturbation can not explain the observed 20% CaCO3 and the absence of significant clay layers at Site 1220 during the PETM. Because all Pacific PETM sites from Leg 198 and Leg 199 show a coherent pattern of minor CCD shoaling, it is highly unlikely that the observed pattern is an artifact caused by bioturbation at all but one site (Site 1220), where bioturbation can be ruled out. Also, if the Shatsky Rise sites were strongly affected by bioturbation, then the sharp drop in δ13C of bulk carbonate (same phase on which %CaCO3 is measured, see Figs. F5-F8 in ref. 20) occurring over a distance of only 2 – 4 cm is difficult to explain. Strong bioturbation should have destroyed the transitions.

The paleowater depth of Site 1221 during the PETM was ~3200 m (refs. 22,23). Measurements of %CaCO3 in the PETM section are available for Hole C (Fig. S4b)22. The pre-PETM %CaCO3 varies strongly between 20% and 80% (Fig. F1 in ref. 22),
drops close to zero during the event and increases to about 90% after the event. Relative to Site 1220, these features indicate a slightly greater paleowater depth of Site 1221 and a location very close to the CCD before the event (within the lysocline), below the CCD during, and above the CCD after the event. This suggests a pre-event CCD in the Equatorial Pacific shallower than 3500 m, consistent with other CCD reconstructions (Fig S5, refs. 14,21).

It is important that the minimum %CaCO$_3$ values during the PETM main phase at Site 1221 (3200 m, Equatorial Pacific) are higher than at the Walvis Ridge sites 1266 (2500 m) and 1262 (3600 m). While minimum %CaCO$_3$ values at Site 1221 vary between 1 and 5%, all minimum values within the clay layers at sites 1266 and 1262 are 1% or less. This makes a significant difference for bottom water undersaturation$^5$ and is consistent with substantially less CCD shoaling at Site 1221 compared to the Walvis Ridge sites during the main event. Given the fact that %CaCO$_3$ at Site 1220 drops to about 20% during the event (above CCD), and at Site 1221 close to 0% (below CCD), the CCD during the main PETM phase must have been located between the paleowater depths of the two sites (2.9 – 3.3 km).

Site 1215 is the northernmost site of Leg 199 and was probably located within the lysocline before the event. The paleowater depth during the PETM was close to that of 1221, i.e. ~3200 m (Fig S5). The dissolution interval appears sharp and carbonate content drops from 60 – 80% to a minimum value of about 10% (G. R. Dickens/L. Leon-Rodriguez, unpublished data). As a result, also at Site 1215, %CaCO$_3$ did not drop to zero during the event and no clay layers comparable to those observed at Walvis Ridge appear to be present.

In summary, our compilation indicates a Pacific CCD shallower than 3500 m prior to the PETM, in agreement with other CCD reconstructions (Fig S5, refs. 14,21). Furthermore, based on the records from Shatsky Rise and the Equatorial Pacific, the Pacific CCD shoaled only slightly during the PETM main event (Fig. S2, green bars).
Relative to Site 1220, these features indicate a slightly greater paleowater depth of Site 1221 and a location very close to the CCD before the event (within the lysocline), below the CCD during, and above the CCD after the event. This suggests a pre-event CCD in the Equatorial Pacific shallower than 3500 m, consistent with other CCD reconstructions (Fig. S5, refs. 14, 21).

It is important that the minimum %CaCO$_3$ values during the PETM main phase at Site 1221 (3200 m, Equatorial Pacific) are higher than at the Walvis Ridge sites 1266 (2500 m) and 1262 (3600 m). While minimum %CaCO$_3$ values at Site 1221 vary between 1 and 5%, all minimum values within the clay layers at sites 1266 and 1262 are 1% or less. This makes a significant difference for bottom water undersaturation and is consistent with substantially less CCD shoaling at Site 1221 compared to the Walvis Ridge sites during the main event. Given the fact that %CaCO$_3$ at Site 1220 drops to about 20% during the event (above CCD), and at Site 1221 close to 0% (below CCD), the CCD during the main PETM phase must have been located between the paleowater depths of the two sites (2.9−3.3 km).

Site 1215 is the northernmost site of Leg 199 and was probably located within the lysocline before the event. The paleowater depth during the PETM was close to that of 1221, i.e. ∼3200 m (Fig. S5). The dissolution interval appears sharp and carbonate content drops from 60−80% to a minimum value of about 10% (G. R. Dickens/L. Leon-Rodriguez, unpublished data). As a result, also at Site 1215, %CaCO3 did not drop to zero during the event and no clay layers comparable to those observed at Walvis Ridge appear to be present.

In summary, our compilation indicates a Pacific CCD shallower than 3500 m prior to the PETM, in agreement with other CCD reconstructions (Fig. S5, refs. 14, 21). Furthermore, based on the records from Shatsky Rise and the Equatorial Pacific, the Pacific CCD shoaled only slightly during the PETM main event (Fig. S2, green bars).

**Figure S5.** (a) CCD history in the Equatorial Pacific estimated by ref. 21 (see Fig. F12 in ref. 21). (b) CCD history in various ocean basins estimated by ref. 14 (see Fig. 4 in ref. 14). Orange lines indicate the position of the CCD in the (Equatorial) Pacific before the PETM.


